

**ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY GCE  
CRITICAL THINKING**

Unit 2: Assessing & Developing Argument

**MONDAY 19 MAY 2008**

**F492/01  
F492/02**

Afternoon

Time: 1 hour 45 minutes

Candidates answer on the question paper

**Additional materials (enclosed):** Answer Sheet for Section A Multiple Choice  
Resource Booklet

**Additional materials (required):**  
None



Candidate  
Forename

Candidate  
Surname

Centre  
Number

--	--	--	--	--

Candidate  
Number

--	--	--	--

**INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES**

- Write your name in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the boxes above.
- Use blue or black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Answer Section A, questions 1–20, on the answer sheet provided in pencil. You are advised to spend not more than 40 minutes on Section A.
- Answer Sections B and C in the spaces on the question paper in blue or black ink.
- Read the Resource Booklet and each question carefully and make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.

**INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES**

- The number of marks for each question is given in brackets [ ] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **120**. Section A comprises 33% of the available marks; Sections B and C comprise 67% of the available marks.
- Up to 5 marks are available for quality of written communication in Sections B and C.

**For Examiner's Use**

<b>Section B /50</b>	
<b>Section C /25</b>	
<b>QWC/5</b>	
<b>Total</b>	

This document consists of **20** printed pages.

**Section A: Multiple Choice**

Answer **all** questions in this section of the paper.

You are advised to spend no more than 40 minutes on this section of the paper.

- 1 The definition of 'Britishness' has to include having some fairly sloppy eating habits. This is because 75% of us are reported to finish our meals by licking our plates. Additionally, there is evidence that most British youngsters never use a knife when eating – apparently using only a fork makes watching TV and eating at the same time easier.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A The definition of being British includes having some fairly poor eating habits.
- B Using only a fork makes it easier to eat and watch TV.
- C Licking plates is a poor eating habit common in Britain.
- D Poor eating habits is the only identifiable characteristic of being British.

[1]

- 2 A recent survey found that 80% of all Americans have purchased fast food in the past four weeks. The cause of the obesity epidemic in America is even clearer when you consider that 1 in 10, aged 14 and over, have bought fast food 5 or more times in the last 4 weeks. Clearly, Americans must stop buying fast food if they want to tackle the health problems associated with an over-weight population.

Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A Most fast food sold in America is unhealthy food with a high fat and salt content.
- B Some Americans eat fast food only occasionally and take regular exercise.
- C Many fast food restaurants sell salads and other healthy snacks.
- D The obesity problem is more pronounced in teenagers than adults.

[1]

- 3 A professor of Archaeology at Oxford University left school, an average comprehensive, with only 5 GCSEs. Perhaps, more importantly, he did not start on an academic path until he was 25. It is evident that his academic potential was not shown until he was in his late 20s. This shows that exams taken at 16, such as GCSEs, are a poor measure of pupils' potential. There is, therefore, no point in assessing pupils at such a young age.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A The professor of Archaeology may not be typical of other professors at Oxford.
- B The professor of Archaeology is unlikely to be representative of all 16 year olds.
- C Other types of exam that can be taken at 16 are ignored.
- D Pupils with limited potential at 16 do not always become successful in later life.

[1]

- 4 Our ability to speak has often been used to distinguish us from animals. However, evidence shows that we had the vocal chords capable of producing articulate speech half a million years before language and speech were common in humans. There is no reason to think that in another half a million years or so many monkeys will not have developed speech, proving that we are not so different from other species.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A All species will eventually develop language and articulate speech.
- B It is not possible to develop articulate speech in less than half a million years.
- C Some monkeys do not currently have the vocal chords needed to produce speech.
- D Many monkeys already have the vocal chords needed to produce speech.

[1]

Questions 5 and 6 refer to the following passage.

We have been buying wine in metric 75cl bottles for decades and car engine size has always been measured in metric litres. Despite the view that the British are generally unable to cope with metric units, our existing familiarity with them would suggest otherwise. It would be far better to use only one system and there seems to be no reason why we would not cope with a completely metric system. We should give up our miles, pounds and ounces and become completely metric.

5 Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **counter assertion** in the above argument?

- A The British do not like using metric units.
- B The British find it difficult to use metric units.
- C The British do not see the purpose of metric units.
- D The British are unfamiliar with metric units.

[1]

6 Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A There would be no disadvantages to only using one system of measurement.
- B Everyone will eventually be happy using metric units for distance and weight.
- C There is no significant difference in the ease of use of the various metric units.
- D Metric units for distance and weight are easier to use than miles and pounds and ounces.

[1]

- 7 The life of a Hollywood film star is supposed to be glamorous and exciting. However, the pressure to 'always look your best' must be daunting and being constantly photographed by the paparazzi downright annoying. Add in the deluded fans writing endless letters, the stalkers and the sad end to so many marriages and a different picture emerges. If we look a little beyond the fancy dresses and glitzy film premieres, we would realise that the life of a Hollywood film star is probably unhappy.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A We should feel sorry for Hollywood film stars who lead unhappy lives .
- B The life of a Hollywood film star is not as glamorous and exciting as is supposed.
- C The glamorous parts of being a Hollywood film star are outweighed by annoying difficulties.
- D A deeper look reveals that the life of a Hollywood film star is likely to be miserable.

[1]

- 8 Many politicians want to convince us that they are environmentally-friendly by driving a hybrid car (partly fuelled by electricity and partly by petrol). Ignoring the fact that hybrids are not the most fuel efficient cars on the market, there is still a serious problem. As politicians know, generating electricity produces vast amounts of pollution and uses irreplaceable reserves, such as North Sea gas. Consideration of the environmental impact of a hybrid car must include the electricity it uses.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A Hybrid cars are less environmentally-friendly than politicians believe.
- B A politician who wants to convince us that they are environmentally-friendly should drive a conventional car.
- C Politicians can only be environmentally-friendly by buying the most fuel efficient cars available.
- D Politicians choosing to drive a hybrid car should not convince us that they are environmentally-friendly.

[1]

- 9 It was thought that the availability of electronic synthesisers, with their pre-programmed rhythms and samples, might have led to a decline in the learning of traditional musical instruments in primary schools. However, we do not need to worry. The guitar is now the most common instrument played by the under 12s, with sales of guitars doubling in the last 4 years.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A An increase in one area cannot disprove an overall decline.
- B We cannot presume that past increases will lead to future increases.
- C The evidence is weakened by reference to only the under 12s.
- D Guitars cannot be compared to electronic synthesisers.

[1]

- 10 The condition of arthritic knees can now be investigated by listening to the sound the knee makes as it bends, rather than by using expensive MRI scans. A healthy knee apparently makes a very different noise from an arthritic one. There are generally long waiting lists for an MRI scan and cheaper treatments will help the finances of our hospitals. We should discourage the use of MRI scans for investigating arthritic knees.

Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A Waiting lists for MRI scans have slightly shortened in recent months.
- B Using the sound made by knees has led to earlier diagnoses of arthritic problems.
- C The difference in sound made is only significant for severely arthritic knees.
- D Training in the use of the sound technique for arthritic knees is still developing.

[1]

- 11 For many women, receiving a marriage proposal should be a romantic and unforgettable moment. Indeed, many women have probably been planning for this moment since they were young girls. However, as many as 75% of women found their husband's proposal of marriage unromantic and disappointing. It seems unlikely that men are suddenly going to become more romantic – it is not in their nature – but it does seem sad that so many women currently end up disappointed.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A Women are always more romantic than men.
- B Women might be wise to have slightly lower expectations of marriage proposals.
- C The disappointment felt by the women is entirely the fault of the men.
- D Women should take the lead and make the proposals themselves.

[1]

- 12 Many of the contestants on TV talent shows have no talent, despite their belief that they have what it takes to be a star. They are displayed in front of us as objects of ridicule. We laugh at them when we ought to feel sorry for them. This also demeans the efforts of those with talent who have worked hard to reach high standards. These programmes should no longer show clips of contestants who have no talent.

Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- A Talent shows on TV show more clips of untalented contestants than talented ones.
- B There are examples of untalented contestants who have entered many TV talent shows.
- C Some of the untalented contestants would perform no better even if they did practise.
- D Many untalented contestants are devastated when they learn that TV audiences are laughing at them.

[1]

- 13 According to stories in the news, adults in this country are far more afraid of challenging the anti-social behaviour of young people than adults in other European countries. There are two main explanations, either our young people are worse behaved than their peers in Europe or the press have exaggerated the anti-social behaviour of our young people. Given that the press have previously exaggerated stories of violent behaviour by football hooligans and the increasing use of guns, the second explanation must be the correct one.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A The analogy between football hooligans and anti-social young people is weak.
- B Past exaggerations by the press does not mean that they are exaggerating now.
- C Exaggerations by the press are unlikely to have caused anti-social behaviour.
- D It is unreasonable to generalise from the anti-social behaviour of some young people to all young people.

[1]

- 14 Despite efforts by schools, the number of students learning languages at GCSE has dropped by 14.7%. Arguments about the need for language skills as European markets become more important obviously have little weight with our 14 year olds making their GCSE choices. Making the subjects compulsory in the early years of secondary school has also had little impact. It would be a tragedy if language skills in this country continue to decline.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A New strategies will be needed to halt the decline in learning languages.
- B There will be serious consequences if the learning of languages continues to decline.
- C The decline in the learning of languages is caused by making it compulsory.
- D It is inevitable that the number of students learning languages at GCSE will continue to decline.

[1]



- 15 Many of the motorists who argue that speeding fines are unfair also complain about parking fines. However, there are significant differences between the two. Speed traps are often hidden or involve mobile units that could appear anywhere and so a motorist could claim that they had not been warned. Parking fines are only issued in areas with clear yellow lines and endless signs warning of the dangers and so offenders do not have reasonable grounds for complaint. Motorists must stop complaining about parking fines if they want their complaints about speeding fines to be taken seriously.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A There are significant differences between parking fines and speeding fines.
- B Motorists can reasonably claim that speeding fines are unfair as they are not warned about speed traps.
- C It is unreasonable for motorists to complain about parking fines given the clear warnings.
- D Ending complaints about parking fines will help motorists' arguments about speeding fines.

[1]

- 16 Employers are now so concerned to remove any distraction that might reduce the productivity of their work force that they are trying to ban office romances. It is hard to imagine a more ill-conceived proposal. It will make employees resent their bosses and make being at work even more unpleasant. It seems quite likely that such a ban will lower the productivity of the work force. Lots of us meet our partners at work so it could even have an undesirable effect on the marriage and birth rates.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A Employers should not ban office romances in an effort to increase productivity.
- B A ban on office romances could affect the marriage and birth rates.
- C It is not easy to think of a worse idea than banning office romances.
- D Employees who resent their bosses are less likely to work hard.

[1]

- 17 There has been a long-term decline in the numbers of science students. The lack of specialist teachers in schools makes the situation particularly worrying. Employers have warned that science graduates from India and China will have to be recruited unless another 2.4 million British scientists and engineers can be found by 2014. If we want to avoid becoming a second-rate scientific nation, we will need to take urgent action. Increasing the number of specialist science teachers in schools would be a sensible first step.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A Our status as a scientific nation depends only on the number of science students.
- B Being taught by a specialist teacher means that students achieve higher science grades.
- C Specialist science teachers are more likely to inspire students to follow a career in science.
- D The difficulty of science subjects has caused the decline in number of science students.

[1]

- 18 All the main news media carried a story which suggested that by the year 3000 an average human will be 6ft tall and coffee coloured – presumably as a result of greater sexual integration between ethnic groups. Although reported as ‘scientific research’, the suggestion flies in the face of all the evidence. Black Africans and White Europeans have been living in Brazil for 3 or 4 centuries without all merging to a common coffee colour. This shows that the research was more speculation than serious scientific study. The media should be more careful in its use of the term scientific research.

Which of the following is **NOT** an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A Changes in skin colour in humans would take far longer than 300 years to be seen.
- B There is significant sexual integration of ethnic groups in Brazil.
- C Scientific research is very unlikely to produce findings that contradict available evidence.
- D Other countries where there is sexual integration between ethnic groups have not produced coffee coloured humans.

[1]

Questions 19 and 20 refer to the following passage.

Despite claims of a pornographic content, some have defended the easy availability of the so-called 'lads mag' because they are read primarily by educated and career orientated young men. However, there are many unsavoury racist publications that we would all wish censored – or banned – irrespective of the supposedly intellectual people that read them. It is clear that we cannot make decisions about the merits of contentious publications by reference only to the nature of the readership. If, instead, we make our decisions based on the content, we can make reference to everyday standards and morality. The pictures of women in lads mags would fit anyone's description of pornography and, in a society where pornography is viewed as wrong and is heavily censored, we should ensure that these lads mags are made far less readily available.

19 Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **intermediate conclusion** of the above argument?

- A Lads mags should be censored so that they are less readily available.
- B We cannot judge the merit of a magazine by considering the type of person who reads it.
- C The pictures of women in lads mags fit the description of pornography.
- D Making decisions based on content allows us to use everyday standards and morality.

[1]

20 Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- A Many lads mags have helped promote a greater awareness of male health issues.
- B Lads mags and magazines for children are often close together on newsagent shelves.
- C Sales of established pornographic magazines have fallen in recent years.
- D Evidence shows that the pictures of muscular men can lead to feelings of inadequacy in the readership.

[1]

**Section B: Analysing and evaluating argument**

**Read document 1, 'The supermarket bill', and answer questions 21 to 30.**

In questions 21 and 22 you are asked to identify parts of the argument presented to you in 'The supermarket bill'. In your answers use **the author's exact wording** as far as possible.

**21 (a)** Identify the main conclusion of the argument presented in the passage.

.....  
.....[2]

**(b)** Identify the intermediate conclusion of the argument presented in the passage.

.....  
.....[2]

**22** Identify **five** reasons that are given to support the conclusion.

1. ....  
.....  
.....[2]

2. ....  
.....  
.....[2]

3. ....  
.....  
.....[2]

4. ....  
.....  
.....[2]

5. ....  
.....  
.....[2]

- 23 What would the author need to assume about the dairy farms that have gone out of business in order to support the author's argument in paragraph 1?

.....

.....

.....[2]

- 24 Give one alternative explanation for the closure of the dairy farms that would counter the author's argument in paragraph 1.

.....

.....[1]

- 25 According to the reasoning in paragraph 1, what general type of British farm is being destroyed?

.....

.....

.....[2]

- 26 (a) In order to support the argument in paragraph 2, where must we assume the typical family does its shopping?

.....[1]

- (b) The author supports the argument in paragraph 2 by using three pieces of evidence about the costs of transporting food. Identify **one** of these pieces of evidence.

.....

.....[1]

- (c) How much support does the evidence in paragraph 2 give to the author's view that there is a great deal of waste involved in transporting food to a supermarket shelf?

Good support / Weak support / No support (circle your answer)

Explain your answer.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....[3]

- 27 In paragraph 4, the author suggests that supermarkets are restricting consumers' choices of food.

Using information from the passage, how would you counter this claim?

.....

.....

.....[2]

- 28 Rejecting as much as 30% of organic food (paragraph 5) certainly seems a waste. What other information would we need to be sure that this evidence strongly supports the author's reasoning?

.....

.....

.....[2]

**29** In paragraph 6, the author blames supermarkets for some of our current health problems.

**(a)** Name or describe a flaw in the reasoning behind this claim.

.....  
.....[1]

**(b)** With reference to the text, explain why the author's reasoning is flawed. You must clearly show why there is a problem with the author's reasoning.

.....  
.....  
.....  
.....[3]

**30** Identify a possible contradiction in document 1.

.....  
.....  
.....[2]

**Read Document 2, 'Corner shop convenience', and answer questions 31 to 35.**

- 31** By considering the purpose of the All-Party Small Shops group, explain why we might question their claim that the 'corner shop will be history by 2015'.

.....  
 .....[2]

- 32** In order to support the reasoning in paragraph 1 relating to the disappearance of the corner shop, give two assumptions that must be made about the 2,000 independent shops that close each year.

1. ....  
 .....  
 .....[2]

2. ....  
 .....  
 .....[2]

- 33** Identify the general principle used by the author in paragraph 1.

.....  
 .....[2]

- 34** In paragraph 1, the author dismisses the arguments of supermarket bosses by suggesting that they are selfish and greedy.

- (a)** Name or describe a flaw in this reasoning.

.....  
 .....[1]

- (b)** With reference to the text, explain why the author's reasoning is flawed. You must clearly show why there is a problem with the author's reasoning.

.....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....[3]



- 35** In paragraph 2, the author likens the closure of corner shops to the closure of coal mines. By considering the similarity or dissimilarity of the ideas presented, evaluate the effectiveness of the reasoning presented in this paragraph.

You should make two separate points.

1. ....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....[2]

2. ....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....[2]

Total marks for section B [50]

**Section C: Developing your own arguments**

**Questions 36 to 38 refer to document 1, 'The supermarket bill'.**

- 36** Supermarkets would want to respond to the points in paragraph 3 by showing that the use of packaging is essential. Write a very short argument consisting of two reasons and a conclusion to support this view.

Reason

.....  
.....[2]

Reason

.....  
.....[2]

Conclusion

.....  
.....[1]

- Marks will be given for a well-structured argument that contains several reasons that support an intermediate conclusion and an overall conclusion. Your argument may also contain examples or evidence and counter assertions.

.....[10]

- You may use information and ideas from the original passages, but you must use them to form a new argument. No credit will be given for repeating the original arguments in 'The supermarket bill'.

.....[10

Total marks for section C [25]